



STATE OF WASHINGTON
OFFICE OF THE STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR
DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
521 Capitol Way South, P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, WA 98504-0911
(360) 664-0388 · FAX (360) 586-4694

September 10, 2012

TO: Brian Earl, President
Graphic Communications Conference
Teamsters Local 767M

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR
Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Carl Lofgren v. Department of Enterprise Services (DES)
Allocation Review Request ALLO-11-083

On July 10, 2012, I conducted a Director's review conference regarding the allocation of Mr. Lofgren's position. Both you and Mr. Lofgren participated in the conference, and his co-workers Janine (Kelly) Barndt and Ed Flaisig observed the conference. Tony Brown, Human Resources Consultant, represented DES, and Kris Brophy, Director's Review Investigator, also participated in the conference.

Background

On October 1, 2011, the former Department of Printing consolidated with other agencies into the newly created DES as a result of Engrossed Substitute Senate Bill 5931. Therefore, the Department of Printing and its classification system ceased to exist on September 30, 2011. As a result, Mr. Lofgren's position, which had previously been allocated as Prepress Digital Technician, was placed into the Washington General Service (WGS) classification system. Because the WGS classification plan does not include the specific job classes previously used by the Department of Printing, DES allocated Mr. Lofgren's position to the existing WGS job class of Digital Printing Operator on a best fit basis. In addition, DES Y-rated Mr. Lofgren's salary pursuant to Article 40.4 of the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the State of Washington and the Coalition, including Teamsters Local 767M (Exhibit 2).

Director's Determination

Mr. Lofgren's position review was based on the Position Description Form (PDF) describing his duties and responsibilities on October 1, 2011 (Exhibit 3). As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file and the verbal comments provided by both parties during the Director's review conference. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. Lofgren's

assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude the Copy Center Lead A class provides the best fit overall, based on the existing job classes.

Summary of Mr. Lofgren's Perspective

Mr. Lofgren asserts his position has primary responsibility for planning, organizing, scheduling, and conducting "preflight" or preparing electronic files for jobs run on high speed copiers in the copy center. While Mr. Lofgren may occasionally operate a high speed copier when needed, he contends that is not the primary focus of his position. Instead, Mr. Lofgren asserts he estimates, plans, schedules, and works with customers on copy center jobs and sets up and converts files using graphic based software that operators then access to run each job. In addition, Mr. Lofgren indicates that he organizes and maintains the electronic files by job number and prepares sample binders that include multiple tabs and PDF files for each job. Mr. Lofgren indicates that he assigns jobs to the operators through scheduling and reviews the work and answers operators' questions as needed. Because Mr. Lofgren prepares files and schedules copy center jobs but does not actually operate the machines the majority of the time, he asserts his position does not fit the Digital Printing Operator classification.

Summary of DES's Reasoning

DES acknowledges the existing general government job classes may not provide a perfect fit for the unique functions assigned to employees performing duties and operating equipment in the print shop. However, DES asserts that of the available class specifications within the general government classification system, Mr. Lofgren's position best fits the Digital Printing Operator classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

Mr. Lofgren's Position Description Form (PDF) describes his position's objective as follows:

The Digital File Specialist position is responsible for preparing electronic files as they arrive and checking for potential problems, building "run ready" files from all incoming types of artwork, converting files to pdf's from hardcopy and native files, and making corrections to incoming proofs. This position also manages the data center electronic file system, provides support to outlying copy centers, and performs the duties of a Digital Print Operator as necessary.

The majority of work assigned to Mr. Lofgren's position (65%) has been described as electronic file preparation. In summary, this includes the following (Exhibit 3):

- Preflight electronic files as they arrive for potential problems such as bleeds, fonts, finish size, low resolution, and graphics.
- Build "run ready" files, including converting files to pdf's from hardcopy and native files and making correcting to incoming proofs.
- Manage data center electronic files system, save incoming files to proper locations, archive old files.
- Operate all copy center equipment needed to produce complete customized jobs.
- Ensure accurate billing by ensuring materials and hand time charges are recorded on all jobs.
- Work with the Coordinator/Production Staff/Manager/assigned staff to produce and prioritize jobs to meet deadlines and participate as a key player in the Production team.

Mr. Lofgren's position reports to the Copy Center Manager. However, during the Director's review conference you and Mr. Lofgren explained that he is responsible for estimating, planning, working with customers, prioritizing, and scheduling all copy center jobs. Mr. Lofgren also determines the type of finishing and price then emails the customer and waits for customer approval. Once approved, he merges information into the Monarch system used for scheduling and billing jobs, and he keeps his supervisor and plant scheduler in the loop.

Mr. Lofgren's position is responsible for setting up all files, backing up files, and managing the electronic file system for copy center jobs. Mr. Lofgren indicated he receives copy center jobs through a variety of ways, including email, an online system (My Print Online), and customer walk-in. After receiving customer approval, Mr. Lofgren converts native files to PDF files, checking for font and graphic issues, and he corrects and manipulates files so they are properly formatted and ready to print on high speed copiers. He essentially creates a scanned image, which is electronically (digitally) sent to the copier. The positions assigned to operate the high speed copiers then go in and open the file to run the job.

While the primary focus of Mr. Lofgren's position is preparing files for use on high speed copiers, he also backs up prepress by using similar software to prepare files for plates used on printing presses as needed. In preparing the files, Mr. Lofgren uses graphic oriented programs such as Adobe Illustrator, InDesign, and Photoshop. His position also works directly with customers and coordinates planning, scheduling, and tracking of inventory to assist the Copy Center Manager and Plant Scheduler.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations. While examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification.

The **Digital Printing Operator** has been defined as a position that "[o]perates one or more office machines such as high speed business photocopiers, reader/scanners, engineering print machines, folding and inserting, bursting, and binder machines for a major portion of time." The Digital Printing Operator typical work statements include the following:

- With minimum training and under general supervision, sets up, adjusts, and operates one or more office machines for volume production;
- Receives periodic work assignments and job requests or on a recurring basis, operates machines to produce finished materials;
- Programs digital copy machines for the production of high quality, full color, as well as black and white digital prints utilizing specialized print drivers;
- Keeps records of production and supplies expended;
- Requests needed machine repairs and supply items;
- Performs daily calibrations of digital copy machines;
- Performs repetitive clerical duties in conjunction with machine operations;
- Prioritizes jobs according to customer need, and reports status to supervisor.

Although Mr. Lofgren occasionally operates high speed copiers when needed and the duties assigned to his position encompass some of the typical work statements, his position does not serve as an operator, and it is not the primary focus of his job. Therefore, allocation to the Digital Printing Operator class is not the best fit.

The **Copy Center Lead A** definition states that positions “[p]rovide copy service through the coordination of activities at assigned copy center(s).”

The Copy Center Lead A distinguishing characteristics read as follows:

Under general direction, responsible for daily operations of assigned copy center(s) each producing 200,000 or more copies per month. Receive, prioritize and process work orders; resolve production conflicts; maintain production and cash sales records; prepare materials for billings and perform routine equipment maintenance. Regularly assign, instruct and check the work of others; assist in performance evaluation of others.

A level - Coordinate daily operations of a single copy center.

While Mr. Lofgren's PDF does not specifically designate his position as a lead, both you and Mr. Brown (DES) agreed the duties discussed during the Director's review conference denoted lead responsibilities. Mr. Lofgren's position has primary responsibility for organizing and prioritizing copy center jobs, reorganizing the workflow as needed, and conducting preflight to ensure correct font, finish, resolution, and graphics before setting up each file that is then accessed by one of the operators. He assigns work through scheduling, answers questions, and ensures copy center operations run smoothly. He also works with customers, provides costs estimates, coordinates scheduling and billing information, and tracks copy center inventory.

The Copy Center Lead A typical work statements that most align with Mr. Lofgren's position include the following:

- Receive and evaluate work orders to establish and assign job priorities; work with clients and staff at other copy centers to meet production requirements and deadlines;
- Maintain positive client relations;
- Maintain work records and prepare reports;
- . . . maintain cash account and billing records;

- Operate photocopy and related equipment; check performance of equipment . . .;
- Order supplies and maintain inventory [with supervisor approval];
- Perform duties of Copy Machine Operator Lead;

In Salsberry v. Washington State Parks and Recreation Commission, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-06-013 (2007), the Personnel Resources Board addressed the concept of best fit. The Board concurred with the former Personnel Appeals Board's conclusion that while the appellant's duties and responsibilities did not encompass the full breadth of the duties and responsibilities described by the classification to which his position was allocated, on a best fit basis, the classification best described the level, scope and diversity of the overall duties and responsibilities of his position. Allegri v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. ALLO-96-0026 (1998).

While some of Mr. Lofgren's duties may fit within the Digital Printing Operator class, the primary focus of his position is to organize, prioritize, set up and schedule copy center jobs rather than operate the machines. In addition, the level of responsibility assigned to his position better aligns with the Copy Center Lead A job class.

It is clear Mr. Lofgren is very skilled and knowledgeable about copy center operations and works hard to ensure jobs run smoothly. A position's allocation is not a reflection of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher level work. Rather, an allocation is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classifications. In this case, based on the available job classes, the Copy Center Lead A classification provides the best overall fit for the duties and responsibilities assigned to his position.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 521 Capitol Way South, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Carl Lofgren
Tony Brown, DES
Lisa Skriletz, OSHRD

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

Carl Lofgren v. DES
ALLO-11-083

List of Exhibits

1. Request for Director's Review Form, received October 14, 2011
2. October 1, 2011 reallocation decision letter from DES
3. Position Description Form in effect on October 1, 2011
4. Digital Printing Operator Class Specification 206H
5. Copy Center Lead A Class Specification 206L